

# Evidence scan of educational interventions for children and young people disengaged from education

For Social Ventures Australia

SEPTEMBER 2018

## Prepared by:

Sarah Pilcher, Kate Torii and Mary Jo Andow

## About Mitchell Institute

Mitchell Institute at Victoria University is an independent think tank that works to improve the connection between evidence and policy reform. Mitchell Institute promotes the principle that high-quality education, from the early years through to early adulthood, is fundamental to individual wellbeing and to a prosperous and successful society. We believe in an education system that is oriented towards the future, creates pathways for individual success, and meets the needs of a globalised economy. The Mitchell Institute was established in 2013 by Victoria University, Melbourne with foundational investment from the Harold Mitchell Foundation.

# ■ Table of contents

<b>Background .....</b>	<b>iv</b>
<b>Key definitions .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>What we looked at .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>What we found .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Appendix A: Summary of resources reviewed .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Appendix B: List of references.....</b>	<b>1</b>

# ■ Background

Social Ventures Australia (SVA) asked the Mitchell Institute to conduct a scan of any evidence on the effectiveness of policies, programs, practices and interventions aimed at strengthening educational and wellbeing outcomes for people highly disengaged from education, employment and training.

This will form part of a larger project refreshing SVA's *Education Perspectives* publications.

As agreed with SVA, the evidence scan focused on:

- Those who are highly disengaged, with less emphasis on those 'at risk of disengagement'.
- Disengagement from education primarily, and disengagement from training and/or work to a lesser extent.
- Disengagement across young people generally, rather than in relation to any particular cohort. For example: young people with a disability, or those in out of home care.

# ■ Research question and scope

## Research question

*What is the evidence on the effectiveness of policies, programs, practices and interventions aimed at strengthening educational and wellbeing outcomes for people highly disengaged from education, employment and training?*

## Key definitions

In line with SVA's cohort definition, the review focused on the intersection of the vulnerable and disengaged. It did not include those who are disengaged, but not vulnerable.

### Definition of key terms (provided by SVA)

**Disengaged** – People 15-19 years old not participating in education or training and (or) unemployed

**Retention** – Number of full time school students in Year 10 that continue to Year 12 (count of total numbers)

**Attendance/participation** – Number of full time equivalent student days attended as a percentage of the total number of possible student attendance days

**Destination** – School leavers leaving school and not engaged with further education and/or employment

**Partial disengagement** – Disengaged with the system, but still partially involved with the system, eg. Disengaged from education but engaged with employment

**Complete disengagement** – Completely disconnected from the system. Ie. Disengaged from both education and employment

# ■ What we looked at

## Sources reviewed

Mitchell reviewed a broad body of evidence on measures to address disengagement among young people. This included published primary research and systematic reviews, as well as selected grey literature from policy/advocacy organisations.

The types of interventions reviewed by the literature broadly fell into six categories:

- Education in alternative/flexible settings
- Mentoring programs
- Case management or counselling approaches
- Employment-focused support or vocational education and training
- Multi-component interventions
- Preventative strategies aimed at *at risk* young people

## Methodology

We reviewed a total of 14 meta-studies, 31 primary studies and 10 selected grey literature resources.

These studies were found through searches on key databases including the Academic Search Premier (EBSCO) and the Educational Resource Information Center (ERIC) in August 2018. The search was undertaken using key terms such as “disengaged”, “Not in Education Employment or Training (NEET)” and “dropout”, as well as “education” or “re-engagement” “interventions” for “youth” and/ or “young people”.

We also conducted a broad ranging desktop review for other relevant resources, including policy and grey literature.

# ■ What we found

## Key findings

Overall the body of evidence **did not yield any clear conclusions** on the effectiveness of policies, programs, practices and interventions aimed at strengthening educational and wellbeing outcomes for people highly disengaged from education, employment and training.

However a number of factors were consistently referred to across the literature as being associated with positive outcomes:

- Creating **personalised/individualised** supports
- Addressing **student wellbeing** and any broader issues the young person is facing outside education
- Creating **relevant and meaningful pathways** that reach beyond the period of the intervention
- Fostering **family and community involvement**
- Creating **strong and trusting relationships**
- Creating a **safe and comfortable setting**
- Creating a **curriculum and pedagogy that mixes general curriculum with applied vocational learning** for work

## Conclusions

Most strategies and interventions reviewed were found to produce **moderate positive effects**.

**No clear picture of a single effective intervention emerged**, in terms of duration, setting, or parameters.

Much of the research finds that **individual programs are unlikely to achieve transformational change** - rather a system of integrated and aligned services is needed, and further research required to understand interactive effects.

Most of the meta-analyses reviewed conclude that the **quality of current evidence is limited**, leaving policy makers and vulnerable young people underserved.

In addition, the research raises an inherent challenge in determining 'what works' for this cohort, as effective interventions for disengaged young people are particularly **variable and relative to context and background**.

The full table of sources reviewed is at **Appendix A**.

A list of references is at **Appendix B**.

- Appendix A: Summary of resources reviewed



# Reviews

Study	Type and methodology	Objective	Findings
<p><b>Beng H., Gorard, S. and Torgerson, C. (2012)</b>  <b>“Promoting Post-16 Participation of Ethnic Minority Students from Disadvantaged Backgrounds: A Systematic Review of the Most Promising Interventions”</b>  <i>Research in Post-Compulsory Education</i> 17:4, 409-22.  <a href="https://www.tandfonline.com/wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/doi/pdf/10.1080/13596748.2012.738968?needAccess=true">https://www.tandfonline.com/wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/doi/pdf/10.1080/13596748.2012.738968?needAccess=true</a></p>	<p>This systemic review identified only 14 intervention studies with a robust evaluation, intended to encourage participation and retention in post-compulsory education for disadvantaged ethnic minority groups.</p>	<p>The paper aimed to evaluate interventions worldwide that are designed to improve the educational participation, retention and attainment of ethnic minority students from disadvantaged backgrounds.            Undertook a systematic review considering interventions that improve post-16 participation or that increase pupils’ chances of staying on in education.</p>	<p>Evidence from the review reveals 6 interventions that have positive effects on improving prospective post-compulsory outcomes for disadvantaged young people from ethnic minority backgrounds. Four of these were interventions in higher education settings and the rest were interventions carried out among children in secondary (high) schools.  <b>Financial incentives</b> (3 studies) Positive effects of the use of monetary incentives and sanctions to improve post-16 participation and retention.  <b>Mentoring</b> (5 studies) mentoring, particularly mentoring provided by faculty members, may have positive effects on educational outcomes of ethnic minority students in both secondary schools and universities.  <b>Close monitoring of school engagement</b> (2 studies) the intervention is based on the belief that young people at risk of failure could be helped to stay on in education if they were more engaged in school.            Two strategies hold the most promise in improving the school outcomes of ethnic minority students from disadvantaged backgrounds - the use of extrinsic motivation in the form of monetary rewards and adult (staff/faculty) mentoring. This is a particularly effective measure for improving school outcomes for older students in higher education.</p>
<p><b>Davies, M., Lamb, S., and Doecke, E. (2011)</b>  <b>“Strategic review of effective re-engagement models for disengaged learners”</b>  <i>Melbourne: Centre for Research on Education Systems-University of Melbourne</i>  <a href="https://www.education.vic.gov.au/documents/about/research/revreenage.pdf">https://www.education.vic.gov.au/documents/about/research/revreenage.pdf</a></p>	<p>Broad literature review including policy and grey literature, and stakeholder consultations.</p>	<p>The review study was commissioned by the Victorian Government and undertaken by Melbourne University. It profiles the characteristics of working age Victorians disengaged from education and training, and documents effective practices and programs to re-engage them.            It also provides advice on programmatic costs, potential funding models and approaches to program evaluation.</p>	<p>The review identified that effective strategies fall into one of four categories related to the focus of the program and the conceptual foundations at play within effective programs: (1) outreach, (2) learner wellbeing, (3) pedagogy, and (4) pathways.  <b>Outreach</b>, need to find some way of connecting with disengaged adults who may be socially and economically marginalised, in order to identify their needs and inform them of available options.  <b>Wellbeing</b> is key to successful interventions, identifying and addressing the welfare needs of disengaged people.  <b>Pedagogy</b>, focuses on the approach to learning that is needed to take account of negative previous experiences of learning.  <b>Pathways</b> focuses on creating and presenting appealing and worthwhile pathways for learners.</p>

Study	Type and methodology	Objective	Findings
<p>Evans, R., Brown, R. Rees, G. and Smith, P. (2017)  <b>“Systematic review of educational interventions for looked-after children and young people: Recommendations for intervention development and evaluation”</b>  <i>British Educational Research Journal</i>, 43:1, 68-94.  <a href="https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.1002/berj.3252">https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.1002/berj.3252</a></p>	<p>Systematic review of fifteen studies reporting on 12 interventions. Nine interventions demonstrated tentative impacts.</p>	<p>The review systematically synthesised the evidence of the effectiveness of interventions addressing the educational outcomes of Looked After Children and Young People (LACYP), as evaluated by use of an RCT. Evaluations were limited to the utilisation of RCTs as this study design generates the most scientifically robust evidence of effect.</p>	<p>The authors found that based on the included studies it is <b>premature to make any claims about intervention impact due to the variable quality of study conduct and reporting.</b>  Of these interventions, nine suggested impact on a range of educational outcomes. Five interventions reported an effect for <b>academic skills</b>. One intervention reported an effect for <b>homework completion</b>. Three interventions reported an effect for <b>school attendance, suspension or drop-out</b>. One intervention reported an effect for <b>teacher-student relationships</b>. No interventions demonstrated an improvement on academic achievement and grade completion, school behaviour or academic attitudes.</p>
<p>Gutherson, P., Davies, H. and Daszkiwicz, T. (2011)  <b>“Achieving successful outcomes through Alternative Education Provision: an international literature review”</b>  <i>CfBT Education Trust.</i>  <a href="https://www.educationdevelopmenttrust.com/~media/EDT/Reports/Research/2011/r-achieving-successful-outcomes-through-alternative-education-provision-full-2011.pdf">https://www.educationdevelopmenttrust.com/~media/EDT/Reports/Research/2011/r-achieving-successful-outcomes-through-alternative-education-provision-full-2011.pdf</a></p>	<p>Broad literature review</p>	<p>The trustees of CfBT education charity commissioned a lit review to understand how to measure the effectiveness of Alternative Education Provision (AEP), bring together evidence of different approaches and identify promising practices.</p>	<p>The evidence reviewed in this document suggests some <b>essential characteristics</b> of effective alternative education:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Based on trusting, caring relationships</li> <li>• Based on effective assessment of need</li> <li>• Person-centred</li> <li>• Purposeful (outcomes focused)</li> <li>• Personalised and appropriate (curriculum/addressing needs)</li> <li>• Flexible and accessible</li> <li>• Delivered by highly skilled and trained staff</li> <li>• Monitored and assessed (to ensure needs are met and to inform delivery)</li> <li>• Supported by the wider family and community.</li> </ul> <p>This review <b>did not successfully identify evidence of the processes or mechanisms by which those characteristics suggested to be integral to effective AEP actually impact on outcomes</b>, nor did it find evidence of causality.</p>
<p>Kendall, S., Straw, S., Jones, M., Springate, I. and Grayson, H. (2008)  <b>“A Review of the research evidence (narrowing the gap in outcomes for vulnerable groups)”</b>  <i>National Foundation for Educational Research.</i>  <a href="https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED502360.pdf">https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED502360.pdf</a></p>	<p>42 sources were summarised onto a template</p>	<p>This report presents findings from a review of the best evidence on narrowing the gap in outcomes across the five Every Child Matters (ECM) areas for vulnerable groups in the context of improving outcomes for all.  Asked, what is the evidence for how gaps are narrowed and what is effective, in relation to – schools improving ECM outcomes and working with other children’s services to improve ECM outcomes.</p>	<p>Key findings:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Schools have been found to narrow the gap in attainment for vulnerable groups (in some instances attainment has been improved across all pupils).</li> <li>• Providing work-related learning opportunities can lead to improved attainment and a greater likelihood of continuing in education and training post-16.</li> <li>• There is evidence that schools have reduced bullying, improved behaviour of some vulnerable groups, and reduced exclusions.</li> <li>• Schools have reduced the likelihood of pupils using drugs and contributed to reducing teenage pregnancies.</li> </ul>

Study	Type and methodology	Objective	Findings
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Activities other than core teaching and learning built into the life of the school, such as pupil decision making, effective pastoral systems and a review of the research evidence out-of-school learning, can improve outcomes.</li> <li>• Approaches to teaching and learning, both pedagogical (e.g. literacy teaching) and organisational (e.g. class size, ratio of teaching assistant to pupils) can help achieve outcomes and narrow the gap.</li> <li>• Effective school leadership, in terms of individual qualities such as vision and skills, and management processes can contribute to improving outcomes.</li> <li>• The involvement of parents and children in interventions has been shown to have a beneficial effect on outcomes.</li> <li>• There was variation in robustness of the evidence reviewed regarding schools narrowing the gap in outcomes for vulnerable groups. <b>The findings should be seen as promising approaches to narrowing the gap that still require further investigation.</b></li> </ul>
<p><b>Mawn, L. et al. (2017)</b>  <b>“Are we failing young people not in employment, education or training (NEETs)? A systematic review and meta-analysis of re-engagement interventions”</b>  <i>Systematic Reviews</i> 6:16.  <a href="https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5264339/pdf/136432016_Article_394.pdf">https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5264339/pdf/136432016_Article_394.pdf</a></p>	<p>Meta-analysis of 18 trials are included (9 experimental and 9 quasi-experimental), sample sizes range from 32 to 54,923.</p>	<p>This systematic review and meta-analysis review synthesises the literature on the effectiveness of interventions targeting young people not in employment, education, or training (NEET).</p>	<p>Finds some evidence that <b>intensive multi-component interventions</b> effectively decrease unemployment amongst NEETs. The quality of current evidence is limited, leaving policy makers wanting when designing and implementing new programs, and a vulnerable population neglected.</p> <p>Intervention approaches include <b>educational</b> (academic, basic, or social skills; advice and guidance, <b>vocational</b> (work placements, career planning, volunteering, <b>counselling or mentoring</b>, or <b>service-based</b> (case management, monitoring).</p> <p>The only meaningful division of interventions was comparing multicomponent to single-component interventions. Successful interventions were high-contact and used multi-component approaches. Taken together, the <b>findings provide some support for the effectiveness of high-contact multicomponent (classroom and work-based) interventions</b> in improving employment prospects for NEET individuals.</p>
<p><b>Maynard, B. et al. (2012)</b>  <b>“Indicated Truancy Interventions: Effects on School Attendance among Chronic Truant Students”</b>  <i>Campbell Systematic Reviews</i>, 2012:10.</p>	<p>Systemic review - a total of 28 studies in 26 reports. Of the studies included, 5 utilized a</p>	<p>Studies must have utilised a randomised, quasi-experimental, or single-group pre-posttest design with the aim of evaluating the effectiveness of interventions with a stated primary goal of increasing student attendance (or decreasing absenteeism) among chronic truant students.</p>	<p>The meta-analytic findings demonstrated a <b>significant overall positive and moderate mean effect of interventions on attendance outcomes</b>. The mean effect size for interventions examined in the included RCT studies was .57 and the mean effect size for the QED studies was .43. No significant differences were observed between the RCT and QED studies in the magnitude of the treatment effect.</p>

Study	Type and methodology	Objective	Findings
<a href="https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED535217.pdf">https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED535217.pdf</a>	randomized design (RCT), 11 utilized a quasi-experimental design (QED), and 12 utilized a single group pre-posttest design (SGPP).	Questions - do truancy programs with a goal of increasing student attendance for truant youth affect school attendance behaviours of elementary and secondary students with chronic attendance problems? 2) Are there differences in the effects of school-based, clinic/community-based, and court-based programs? 3) Are some modalities (i.e., family, group, and multimodal) more effective than others in increasing student attendance?	No differences were found between school, court or community-based programs or between different modalities of programs. The duration of the intervention also did not demonstrate any association with effect size. Collaborative programs and multimodal interventions produced statistically similar effects on attendance as non-collaborative and single-modality programs, which runs counter to the prevailing beliefs and recommendations for best practices in truancy reduction found in the literature.
<b>O’Gorman, E., Salmon, N. and Murphy, C. (2016)</b> <b>“Schools as sanctuaries: A systematic review of contextual factors which contribute to student retention in alternative education”</b> <i>International Journal of Inclusive Education, 20: 5, 536-551.</i> <a href="https://tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13603116.2015.1095251">https://tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13603116.2015.1095251</a>	Systemic review - data from 24 mixed-methods studies that met the inclusion criteria were extracted and synthesised.	This systematic review aims to gather marginalised young peoples’ perceptions concerning contextual factors that contributed to and interfered with their decisions to stay in alternative education.	Findings suggested that alternative schools which provided a sanctuary for students increased student engagement. Schools were sanctuaries when they offered physical, emotional and psychological safe spaces; fostered a sense of community; enabled students to affirm their racial/ethnic pride and employed flexible behavioural supports. The studies within this review suggested that alternative schools which provided a sanctuary for students, increased student engagement both academically and within the school community.
<b>Rodri’guez-Planas, N. (2012)</b> <b>“Mentoring, educational services, and incentives to learn: What do we know about them?”</b> <i>Evaluation and Program Planning, 35:4, 481-490.</i> <a href="https://ac-els-cdn-com.wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/S0149718912000183/1-s2.0-S0149718912000183-main.pdf?_tid=27e5a88f-caa6-4400-9782-fc0ba0e34921&amp;acdnat=1534834979_9eac1225335b6e1d07d7bd46a8d8d457">https://ac-els-cdn-com.wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/S0149718912000183/1-s2.0-S0149718912000183-main.pdf?_tid=27e5a88f-caa6-4400-9782-fc0ba0e34921&amp;acdnat=1534834979_9eac1225335b6e1d07d7bd46a8d8d457</a>	Broad reviews of recent studies.	This paper reviews recent studies on the effectiveness of services and incentives offered to disadvantaged youths both in the US and abroad. Focuses analysis on three types of interventions: mentoring, educational services, and financial rewards. Explains alternative theoretical points of view in favour (or against) then discusses how recent empirical work has affected that view and summarize the latest findings.	Looked at mentoring, education services and financial rewards: <b>Mentoring</b> - mentoring programs have positive but modest effects on young participants, and vulnerable or disadvantaged youth benefit most. <b>Educational services and human capital theory</b> -to encourage completion, academic support services are offered to students who are vulnerable to leaving school. Educational services, such as remedial education, show mixed results in studies. Some studies found success with younger children but no effects on school leavers for high school students. More recent studies, however, have found positive returns for educational services offered at the high school level. <b>Financial incentives awards</b> -the theory is that financial incentives should increase effort in school. This has been disputed by several researchers. In both older and newer studies, results have been mixed regarding the outcomes of offering financial incentives to students.
<b>Tanner-Smith, E. and Wilson, S. (2013)</b> <b>“A meta-analysis of the Effects of dropout prevention programs on school absenteeism”</b>	Meta-analysis - 74 studies included in the review, with results from the	The meta-analysis synthesized 74 effect sizes measuring post-test differences in school absenteeism outcomes for youth enrolled in dropout prevention programs relative to a comparison group.	The authors sought to understand whether – given the theoretical and empirical links between school absenteeism and leaving school – dropout prevention programs may also be effective in reducing absenteeism. The growing body of dropout prevention research has increasingly begun to focus on the effects of dropout prevention programs on absenteeism,

Study	Type and methodology	Objective	Findings
<p><i>Prevention Science</i> 14:5, 468-478.  <a href="https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/23420475">https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/23420475</a></p>	<p>24 RCTs in the left panel and results from the 50 QEDs in the right panel.</p>		<p>treating absenteeism not only as a target of the intervention and potential change-agent, but also as a proximal outcome of the interventions.</p> <p>Found that that dropout programs may have beneficial effects on school absenteeism among primarily male samples, and younger samples. Although <b>no single type of intervention program was consistently more effective than others, vocational oriented and supplemental academic training programs showed some promise</b>. However, the inconsistency in results and the possibility of small study bias mean the quality of evidence in this literature is low, at this time there is not enough evidence. However, setting absenteeism aside, <b>dropout prevention programs are successful in achieving their intended goal: to reduce dropouts</b>.</p>
<p>Valentine, J. et al. (2009)  <b>“Systematic reviews of research: Postsecondary transitions - identifying effective models and practices”</b>  <i>National Centre for Career and Technical Education</i>.  <a href="https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED507727.pdf">https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED507727.pdf</a></p>	<p>Systemic review - 19 studies of interventions that aim to keep students in college once they get there</p>	<p>Address the following questions: (a) What models or programs of transition exist? (b) On what basis can we say one transition program is more effective than another? (c) How are transition models and programs evaluated? And (d) What is the impact of transition programs, specifically those that aim to facilitate transition from one educational system to another, to program completion, or to specific career-related employment for disadvantaged youth?</p>	<p>The 19 studies suggest small but potentially important effects on short-term grades earned by program participants. However, this review suggests that there is reason to be optimistic about the potential for relatively comprehensive interventions to help students earn better grades and stay in school, at least in the short term. Transition programs may be academically preparatory in nature, such as those teaching content and skills that are valuable in college. Other programs are more supportive, providing information about applying for college and financial aid, economic assistance to qualified students, or social services that address the barriers a student may face. Many programs are both preparatory and supportive, intervening as necessary to improve transition outcomes.</p> <p>The most striking finding is that many interventions supporting transition of interest to policymakers <b>lack even one experimental evaluation</b> and most existing non-experimental evaluations are of undetermined inferential strength.</p>
<p>Wheeler, M., Keller, T. and DuBois, D. (2010)  <b>“Review of three recent randomized trials of school-based mentoring: Making sense of mixed findings”</b>  <i>Social Policy Report</i>, 24: 3.  <a href="https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED519242.pdf">https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED519242.pdf</a></p>	<p>Reviewed 3 RCTs.</p>	<p>The review presented a comparative analysis of the three studies. The studies evaluated programs implemented by Big Brothers Big Sisters of America (BBBSA) affiliates (Herrera et al., 2007), Communities In Schools of San Antonio, Texas (Karcher, 2008), and grantees of the U.S. Department of Education’s Student Mentoring Program (Bernstein et al., 2009).</p>	<p>Aggregating results across the studies using meta-analytic techniques, the authors found evidence that <b>school-based mentoring can be modestly effective for improving selected outcomes</b> (i.e., support from non-familial adults, peer support, perceptions of scholastic efficacy, school-related misconduct, absenteeism, and truancy). Program effects are not apparent, however, for academic achievement or other outcomes. Policy-makers considering various options for investment in school-based prevention have reason to be somewhat sceptical and to call for more convincing evidence, whereas practitioners developing and delivering this intervention have reason to claim that school based mentoring can achieve positive results and to be optimistic about the possibility of further improvements.</p>

Study	Type and methodology	Objective	Findings
			<p>Given the diversity of school-based mentoring models and programs and the fact that mentoring is an individualized intervention, planners must consider which model will work for which students under which circumstances. However, the existing evidence addresses the effectiveness of this approach only at a very general, aggregated level.</p>
<p><b>Wilson, S. et al. (2013)</b>  <b>“Dropout prevention and intervention programs for improving school completion among school-aged children and youth: A systematic review”</b>  <i>Journal of the Society for Social Work and Research, 4:4.</i>  <a href="https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/abs/10.5243/jsswr.2013.22">https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/abs/10.5243/jsswr.2013.22</a></p>	<p>Systemic review  - reviewed 152 dropout prevention studies.</p>	<p>The objective of this systematic review was to summarize the available evidence on the effects of prevention and intervention programs for increasing school completion or reducing school dropout among primary and secondary students.</p>	<p>This review examined 152 dropout prevention programs. The random effects mean odds ratio for the general programs was 1.72. Using an average control group dropout rate of 21.1%, the mean odds ratio translates to a dropout rate of 13% for the program groups. These results indicate substantial improvements in school completion and dropout rates for students participating in prevention and intervention programs. Overall, results indicated that <b>most school- and community-based programs were effective in decreasing school dropout</b>. However, higher <b>implementation quality</b> tended to be associated with larger effects. Given the minimal variation in effects across program types, the review shows that—regardless of type—dropout prevention and intervention programs are likely to be effective if they are well implemented and appropriate for the local environment.</p> <p>The most notable finding was that <b>no single prevention or intervention strategy stood out as better than any other</b>. The results suggest that the particular program strategy chosen makes less of a difference in eventual outcome than selecting a strategy that can be implemented successfully by the school or agency.</p>
<p><b>Zaff, J. et al. (2017)</b>  <b>“Factors that promote high school graduation: a review of the literature”</b>  <i>Education Psychology Review, 29, 447-476.</i>  <a href="https://link-springer-com.wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/content/pdf/10.1007%2Fs10648-016-9363-5.pdf">https://link-springer-com.wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/content/pdf/10.1007%2Fs10648-016-9363-5.pdf</a></p>	<p>Literature review - 10 evidence-based factors from 41 articles.</p>	<p>Review focussed on the role that individual and contextual assets play in promoting high school graduation and/or continued school enrolment.</p>	<p>The authors list a range of individual, family and school level factors promoting high school graduation.</p> <p><b>Intrinsic motivation</b> - Three studies focused on intrinsic motivation as a predictor of continued enrolment and graduation. <b>School engagement</b> - School engagement can be behavioural, emotional, and/or cognitive. Students exhibiting high levels of all three types of engagement are less likely to leave school before graduation. <b>Youth expectations for academic attainment</b> - five studies reveal that academic expectations of students’ for themselves predict graduation and continued enrolment. <b>Locus of control</b> - young people who believe they control their academic outcomes persist towards graduation when they encounter difficulties. <b>Parental academic involvement</b>- the authors found a consistent link between parental involvement and high school graduation or continued enrolment. <b>Parent-child connection</b> - parental support leads to self-confidence and cooperative behaviour, and also predicts high school graduation or continued enrolment. <b>Positive peer norms</b> - In one study, higher grades among a students’ peer group predicted an increase in the likelihood of graduating. <b>Positive student-teacher relationships, school-sponsored</b></p>

Study	Type and methodology	Objective	Findings
			<b>extracurricular activities, small schools, career and technical education</b> - in the US, these courses have mainly been directed at students who do not plan to enrol in tertiary studies. Several studies support the notion that these courses promote continued enrolment in school. <b>Participation in community-based out-of-school time programs</b> - several programs promoted continued enrolment and graduation from high school for socioeconomically disadvantaged urban students of colour.

## Primary studies

Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
<p><b>Alzua, M. Cruces, G. and Lopez-Eraza, C. (2013)</b>  <b>“Youth training programs beyond employment. Evidence from a randomised controlled trial”.</b>  <a href="https://www.unine.ch/files/live/sites/irene/files/shared/documents/Recherche%20et%20mandats/S%C3%A9minaires%20en%20%C3%A9conomie/S%C3%A9minaires%20en%20%C3%A9conomie%20et%20finance/2013-2014/Alzua.pdf">https://www.unine.ch/files/live/sites/irene/files/shared/documents/Recherche%20et%20mandats/S%C3%A9minaires%20en%20%C3%A9conomie/S%C3%A9minaires%20en%20%C3%A9conomie%20et%20finance/2013-2014/Alzua.pdf</a></p>	Latin America	<p>This paper documents the effects of a training program for low income youths, which comprises vocational training, life skills and work experience <i>entra21</i> is a program that targets especially vulnerable, unemployed youths who have finished high school. The 220 lottery winners and the 187 losers would be informed of the results and training would start soon after that.</p> <p>Around one third of the program participants are male, average age is 23.</p>	Results show large gains in employment, with effects that remain more than two years after the intervention.
<p><b>Attanasio, O. Kugler, A. and Meghir, C. (2011)</b>  <b>“Subsidizing vocational training for disadvantaged youth in Colombia: Evidence from a randomised trial”</b>  <i>American Economic Journal: Applied Economics</i>, 3, 188-220.  <a href="https://www.povertyactionlab.org/sites/default/files/publications/472-%20-%20training%20disadvantaged%20">https://www.povertyactionlab.org/sites/default/files/publications/472-%20-%20training%20disadvantaged%20</a></p>	Colombia	<p>This paper evaluates the impact of a randomized training program for disadvantaged youth introduced in Colombia in 2005.</p> <p>It used originally collected data on individuals randomly offered and not offered training.</p> <p>The program Jóvenes en Acción (which translates as Youth in Action) was introduced between 2001 and 2005 and provided three months of in-classroom training and three months of on-the-job training to young people between the ages of 18</p>	Women offered training earn 19.6 percent more and have a 0.068 higher probability of paid employment than those not offered training, mainly in formal-sector jobs.



Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
<a href="#">youth%20in%20Colombia%20July2011%20AEA.pdf</a>		and 25 in the two lowest socioeconomic strata of the population.	
<b>Borland, J. and Tseng, Y. (2007)</b> “Does a minimum job search requirement reduce time on unemployment payments? Evidence from the Jobseeker Diary in Australia” <i>Industrial and Labour Relations Review</i> , 60:3, 357-378. <a href="http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/001979390706000303">http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/001979390706000303</a>	Australia	This study examines the impact of the Jobseeker Diary (JSD), a program designed to increase the job search effort of unemployed persons in Australia. The sample is also restricted to payment recipients aged 18-49. The empirical approach used to estimate the effect of the JSD is a quasi-experimental matching method. Fundamentally, this involves comparing payment outcomes for a treatment group of recipients who participated in JSD with payment outcomes for a matched control group of recipients.	The authors find that JSD participation was associated with an <b>increased rate of exit from unemployment payment recipiency and a shorter total time spent on payments</b> . Payment receipt duration is estimated to have fallen for about one-half of JSD participants. The <b>largest effects of the JSD occurred for payment recipients for whom labour demand conditions were the most favourable</b> . Cost-benefit analysis suggests a fairly large net societal gain per program participant. Cost-benefit analysis suggests a fairly large net societal gain per program participant.
<b>Borland, J., Tseng, Y. and Wilkins, R. (2013)</b> “Does coordination of welfare services delivery make a difference for extremely disadvantaged jobseekers? Evidence from the ‘YP4’ Trial”, <i>Economic Record</i> , 89:287, 469-489. <a href="https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.1111/1475-4932.12062">https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.1111/1475-4932.12062</a>	Australia	Fragmented welfare service delivery has been identified as a significant barrier to improving outcomes for highly disadvantaged populations. The YP4 trial, conducted from 2005 to 2009, sought to evaluate, by randomised control method, an approach proposed by Campbell et al. (2003) for integrating delivery of employment, housing, health and other services for young homeless jobseekers. Rather than providing extra access to services or utilisation of different services, the YP4 trial involved assignment of a case manager to tailor and coordinate available services to reflect the specific circumstances of young homeless jobseekers. Only 445 participants were ultimately recruited, 75 short of the target number.	Found that the YP4 program did not have a significant effect on economic or psychological well-being, a finding that is robust to application of experimental and quasi-experimental methods. One lesson is that ‘you get what you pay for’. The implementation of case management in the YP4 trial appears to have made it a relatively minimal intervention. A second lesson is that <b>administration matters</b> . Much about whether a programme will be successful depends on its <b>implementation</b> . Partly this is about the programme actually being received by its intended recipients. We have seen in the case of the YP4 trial that 20 per cent of the treatment group never met with their case manager, and over 50 per cent met with a case manager on average only once every six months during the trial. Implementation is also about the effectiveness of case management. That this may have been an issue in the YP4 trial is suggested by our finding that there was no effect of the programme on utilisation or difficulty of accessing services.
<b>Cave, G., Bos, H., Doolittle, F. and Toussaint, C. (1993)</b> “JOBSTART: Final report on a program for school dropouts”, <i>Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation</i> . <a href="https://www.mdrc.org/sites/default/files/full_416.pdf">https://www.mdrc.org/sites/default/files/full_416.pdf</a>	United States	JOBSTART consisted of working within the main federal training program for disadvantaged youths — the Job Training Partnership Act (JTPA) system — to provide a combination of basic skills education, occupational training, support services, and job placement assistance for low-skilled, young school dropouts. JOBSTART’s major goal was to increase the employment and earnings and reduce the welfare receipt of young, low-skilled school dropouts.	JOBSTART led to a <b>significant increase in the rate at which the youths passed the GED (General Educational Development) examination or completed high school</b> . Overall, 42 percent of those in the experimental group attained this milestone, as compared to 28.6 percent in the control group, and similar impacts were present for most key subgroups of the sample. For all groups, most of the increase in educational attainment came through receipt of a GED rather than completion of high school. As expected, youths in the experimental group earned less on average than those in the control group during the first year of follow-up. In the final two years of follow-up, experimentals’ earnings appeared to overtake those of



Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
		<p>The four central program components were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Instruction in basic academic skills</li> <li>• Occupational skills</li> <li>• Training-related support services including assistance with transportation and child care,</li> <li>• Job placement assistance to help JOBSTART youths find training-related jobs.</li> </ul> <p>Implemented between 1985 and 1988 in 13 sites ranging from community-based organizations to schools to Job Corps Centers.</p> <p>The 2,312 youths who applied for JOBSTART and were judged eligible were randomly assigned to either the experimental or control group.</p>	<p>controls for the full sample (by approximately \$400 per year), and there were similar patterns for several subgroups. In most cases, however, the magnitude of these impacts was disappointing and they were not statistically significant according to the usual tests.</p>
<p><b>Chen, X. (2013)</b>  <b>“Partial identification of average treatment effects in program evaluation: Theory and applications”</b>,  <b>Open Access Dissertations, 1050.</b>  <a href="https://scholarlyrepository.miami.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=&amp;httpsredir=1&amp;article=2061&amp;context=oa_dissertations">https://scholarlyrepository.miami.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=&amp;httpsredir=1&amp;article=2061&amp;context=oa_dissertations</a></p>	<p>United States</p>	<p>The dissertation employs the derived bounds to evaluate the effectiveness of the Job Corps (JC) program, which is the largest federally-funded job training program for disadvantaged youth in the United States, with the focus on labour market outcomes and welfare dependence.</p>	<p>JC enrolment <b>increases weekly earnings by at least \$24.61 and employment by at least 4.3 percentage points four years after randomization</b>, and decreases yearly dependence on public welfare benefits by at least \$84.29.</p>
<p><b>Courtney, M., Zinn, A., Zielewski, E., Bess, R., Malm, K., Stagner, M. &amp; Pergamit, M. (2008)</b>  <b>“Evaluation of the early start to emancipation preparation – tutoring program Los Angeles County, California: Final report”</b>,  <b>Chicago, The Urban Institute, Chaplin Hall Center for Children and National Opinion Research Center.</b>  <a href="https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/resource/evaluation-of-the-early-start-to-emancipation-preparation-tutoring">https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/resource/evaluation-of-the-early-start-to-emancipation-preparation-tutoring</a></p>	<p>United States</p>	<p>Evaluated the Early Start to Emancipation Preparation (ESTEP)-Tutoring program of Los Angeles County, California. ESTEP-Tutoring offers a service (i.e., tutoring) that is provided in numerous locations throughout the United States. The program offers services beyond tutoring, including a mentoring relationship with the tutor and access to other independent living workshops provided through the ESTEP program.</p> <p>The evaluation consists of two components: an impact study involving three in-person interviews over two years and a process study. The sampling frame for the evaluation was all foster youths referred for ESTEP-Tutoring during the study period. Referred youths were assessed by the program. Those deemed appropriate for tutoring were randomly assigned to either the treatment group, referred to as “ESTEP group,” or the control</p>	<p>The program <b>had no impacts on educational outcomes</b>. No statistically significant differences were observed between the ESTEP and control groups in any of the outcomes at the second follow-up. Youths assigned to the ESTEP group were more likely to have received educational tutoring at home than control group youths. Yet youths who did not participate in ESTEP-Tutoring but reported some exposure to other forms of tutoring were more likely to have received schoolbased tutoring. However, with respect to the ESTEP-Tutoring program, the impact evaluation did not find compelling evidence that this program had any beneficial impact on the outcomes we assessed.</p> <p>This has significant implications for the evaluation of tutoring programs targeting foster youths, making it difficult to establish a control group that does not have access to some other tutoring program.</p>

Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
		group. The analytical sample consists of 445 youth who were referred to the ESTEP-Tutoring program.	
<p><b>Creed, P. (1999)</b>  <b>"Predisposing factors and consequences of occupational status for long-term unemployed youth: a longitudinal examination", <i>Journal of Adolescence</i>, 22:1, 81-93.</b>  <a href="https://research-repository.griffith.edu.au/bitstream/handle/10072/13001/11724.pdf?sequence=1">https://research-repository.griffith.edu.au/bitstream/handle/10072/13001/11724.pdf?sequence=1</a></p>	Australia	<p>This paper reports on immediate and long-term well-being outcomes for a group of long-term unemployed youth who attended specially devised training courses based on the cognitive-behaviour therapy (CBT). The courses were aimed specifically at improving the mental health of participants, and providing them with coping skills to deal better with the negative consequences of prolonged unemployment.</p> <p>Participants in this study were 43 unemployed young people, who were drawn from across two broad metropolitan regions of Brisbane, one inner city, the other outer suburban. Control subjects were 22 young unemployed who resided in the same areas as the participants. Participants and control subjects met the same eligibility criteria for government sponsored labour market training programmes. All 65 subjects (54 per cent male; mean age 19 years, range 16.9-23.8 years.</p>	<b>No significant differences were identified between the control and participant groups on any of the demographic variables.</b>
<p><b>Devanney, C. (2009)</b>  <b>"Realistic expectations: accounting for young people's progress in training programmes"</b>  <i>International Journal of Public Sector Management</i>, 22: 1, 8-20.  <a href="https://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10.1108/09513550910922360">https://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10.1108/09513550910922360</a></p>	United Kingdom	An in-depth study, over a two-year period, of a number of training programmes.	The study is of a small number of training programmes so it is not possible to generalise from the findings. A limitation of the paper is that the ethical, moral and practical implications of the study are not explored.
<p><b>Durlak, J., Weissberg, R. and Pachan, M. (2010)</b>  <b>"A meta-analysis of after-school programs that seek to promote personal and social skills in children and adolescents", <i>American Journal of Community Psychology</i>, 45:(3-4), 294-309.</b>  <a href="https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20300825">https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20300825</a></p>	United States	<p>A meta-analysis of after-school programs that seek to enhance the personal and social skills of children and adolescents between the ages of 5 and 18.</p> <p>The personal and social skills could include any one or a combination of skills in areas such as problem-solving, conflict resolution, self-control, leadership, responsible decision-making, or skills related to the enhancement of self-efficacy or self-esteem.</p>	Compared to controls, participants demonstrated significant increases in their self-perceptions and bonding to school, positive social behaviours, school grades and levels of academic achievement, and significant reductions in problem behaviours.

Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
<p>Grace, M. and Gill, R. (2014) "Improving outcomes for unemployed and homeless young people: Findings of the YP4 clinical controlled trial of joined up case management", <i>Australian Social Work</i>, 67:3 419-437.  <a href="https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0312407X.2014.911926">https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0312407X.2014.911926</a></p>	Australia	<p>The YP4 study was a clinical controlled trial (CCT) of joined up services for young people experiencing both homelessness and unemployment in Victoria, Australia. The name "YP4" refers to young people and the four key aspects of the trial: purpose (employment), place (accommodation), personal support, and proof (research). The joined up service delivery (J group, n = 222) participants were offered intensive client-centred case management, involving direct provision of a range of services as well as the brokering of additional services. The standard services (S group, n = 174) participants remained eligible for standard services.</p>	<p>Both groups <b>improved their circumstances over the two years of the trial</b>. The results showed no statistically significant treatment effects. The effect for employment earnings was approaching significance (p = .06) with J group increasing their employment earnings to a greater extent than S group.</p>
<p>Green, J. et al (2014) "Multidimensional treatment foster care for adolescents in English care: Randomised trial and observational cohort evaluation" <i>British Journal of Psychiatry</i>, 204, 214–221.  <a href="https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/the-british-journal-of-psychiatry/article/multidimensional-treatment-foster-care-for-adolescents-in-english-care-randomised-trial-and-observational-cohort-evaluation/A68FEE7B0EC9A4F6ACC5C972DAD9BC7C">https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/the-british-journal-of-psychiatry/article/multidimensional-treatment-foster-care-for-adolescents-in-english-care-randomised-trial-and-observational-cohort-evaluation/A68FEE7B0EC9A4F6ACC5C972DAD9BC7C</a></p>	United Kingdom	<p>To examine the efficacy of Multidimensional Treatment Foster Care for Adolescents (MTFC-A) compared with usual care for young people at risk in foster care in England.</p> <p>In MTFC-A, specialist foster parents receive training and ongoing support and supervision in the intensive social learning approach pioneered at the Oregon Social Learning Center. Attention is paid to the mental health of foster children through the provision of psychiatry and psychology input, including individual and family therapy, social skills training and support with education. The aim is for a short-term intensive placement, of around 9 months, followed by a short period of aftercare.</p> <p>A two-arm single (assessor) blinded randomised controlled trial (RCT) embedded within an observational quasi-experimental case-control study involving 219 young people aged 11–16 years (trial registration: ISRCTN 68038570). The primary outcome was the Child Global Assessment Scale (CGAS). Secondary outcomes were ratings of educational attendance, achievement and rate of offending.</p>	<p>The MTFC-A group showed a non-significant improvement in CGAS outcome in both the randomised cohort (n = 34, adjusted mean difference 1.3, 95% CI –7.1 to 9.7, P = 0.75) and in the trimmed observational cohort (n = 185, adjusted mean difference 0.95, 95% CI –2.38 to 4.29, P = 0.57). No significant effects were seen in secondary outcomes. There was a possible differential effect of the intervention according to antisocial behaviour. There was <b>no evidence that the use of MTFC-A resulted in better outcomes than usual care</b>. The intervention may be more beneficial for young people with antisocial behaviour but less beneficial than usual treatment for those without.</p>
Jeynes, W. (2012)	United States	A meta-analysis of 51 studies pre-kindergarten-12th-grade school children	<b>Parental involvement programs, as a whole, were associated with higher academic achievement</b> by .3 of a standard deviation unit.

Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
<p>“A meta-analysis of the efficacy of different types of parental involvement programs for urban students”,  <i>Urban Education</i>, 47, 706–742.  <a href="http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0042085912445643">http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0042085912445643</a></p>			
<p>Keddie, A. (2014)  “Indigenous representation and alternative schooling: Prioritising an epistemology of relationality.”  <i>International Journal of Inclusive Education</i>, 18:1, 55-71.  <a href="https://www.tandfonline.com/wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/doi/pdf/10.1080/13603116.2012.756949?needAccess=true">https://www.tandfonline.com/wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/doi/pdf/10.1080/13603116.2012.756949?needAccess=true</a></p>	Australia	<p>A case study from a small alternative Indigenous school in Queensland, from the perspective of the school’s Indigenous elders and school staff.  This independent K-12 alternative school caters predominantly to Indigenous students (who are highly disadvantaged).</p>	<p>The author notes that alternative schools can be highly effective for students who are economically and culturally disadvantaged compared to “large, impersonal, bureaucratic schools” where many of these students are vulnerable to academic failure. The author also notes that “Indigenous-led alternative schooling environments can be the sites of belonging, sharing and connection that are necessary in beginning to reconcile the gravity of Indigenous disadvantage.”  The success of Maori students in New Zealand who created their own learning environments is based on “transformative principles” that are useful in the Australian context as well. The principles include: self-determination or relative autonomy, validating and legitimating cultural aspirations and identity, incorporating culturally preferred pedagogy, mediating socio-economic and home difficulties, incorporating cultural structures which emphasise the ‘collective’ rather than the ‘individual’ such as the notion of extended family.</p>
<p>Kettlewell, K., Southcott, C., Stevens, E. and McCrone, T. (2012)  “Engaging the disengaged”,  National Foundation for Education Research (NFER) Research Program: Form Education to Employment.  <a href="https://www.nfer.ac.uk/publications/ETDE01/ETDE01.pdf">https://www.nfer.ac.uk/publications/ETDE01/ETDE01.pdf</a></p>	United Kingdom	<p>The research is based on six case-study schools with different support programs for Year 10 students.</p>	<p>Key findings for students at risk of disengagement:  Most programs integrate <b>two or more approaches</b> to preventing disengagement including: alternative curricula, employer involvement, careers guidance, mentoring, vocational training options etc.  <b>Effective elements</b> of the programs included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Positive relationships between learners and staff</li> <li>• One-to-one (individualized) support</li> <li>• Practical, hands-on application</li> <li>• A flexible program to meet student needs</li> <li>• Small class sizes with a high adult to student ratio</li> </ul> <p>Soft outcomes included higher self-confidence, improved attitudes towards learning, and more. Hard outcomes included increased attendance, higher achievement in numeracy and literacy, and progression to apprenticeships, employment, or further study.</p>
<p>Leve, L., and Chamberlain, P. (2007)  “A randomised evaluation of multidimensional treatment foster</p>	United States	<p>Between 1997 and 2002, juvenile court judges in Oregon State referred 103 girls for enrolment into the study on multidimensional treatment foster care (MTFC). Referrals were made consecutively</p>	<p>As is indicated in Table 1, MTFC girls had <b>higher mean levels of homework completion and school attendance than GC</b> girls at both post-baseline assessments.</p>

Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
<p><b>care: Effects on school attendance and homework completion in juvenile justice girls”,</b>  <i>Research on Social Work Practice, 17, 657–663.</i>  <a href="https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2151756/">https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2151756/</a></p>		<p>and included all female youth who met the following criteria (N = 81): 13–17 years old, not currently pregnant, at least one criminal referral in the prior 12 months, and placed in out-of-home care within 12 months following referral.</p>	<p>The results of this trial suggest that MTFC effectively reduced girls’ delinquency outcomes and effectively increased girls’ educational engagement. Specifically, MTFC girls spent about 150% more time on homework at 12 months post baseline than they did at baseline.</p>
<p><b>McGinty, S., Stemp, K. and Wilson, K. (2011)</b>  <b>“Re-engaging young people with education and training: What are the alternatives”,</b>  <i>Youth Studies Australia, 30:4, 32-39.</i>  <a href="https://youthplusinstitute.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Re-engaging-young-people-with-education-and-training.pdf">https://youthplusinstitute.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Re-engaging-young-people-with-education-and-training.pdf</a></p>	Australia	<p>A review of the literature on what attributes create effective alternative learning environments, focusing on programs in Queensland.</p>	<p>The author notes that in extensive surveys, there is a great deal of diversity in the goals of alternative programs, making a precise definition of “what works” for disengaged young people problematic. Their general recommendations, however, are as follows:  <b>Alternative schools must embrace a holistic and integrated approach</b> to teaching and learning that considers the entire needs of a vulnerable young person. This requires consideration of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Physical structures (e.g. Well-equipped buildings that allow for a variety of curriculum options like kitchens and manual work spaces)</li> <li>• Transportation services for students</li> <li>• Staffing (qualified teaching, welfare, and support staff)</li> <li>• Strategic planning (a long term vision for the program)</li> <li>• Curriculum (best practice curriculum and culturally responsive pedagogy)</li> </ul> <p>Alternative learning should offer a <b>full-service program that enlists help from the community</b> to provide additional support for students. Partnerships with local businesses and organizations can also be helpful in reducing persistent funding issues many alternative schools face.</p>
<p><b>McGregor, G. and Mills, M. (2012)</b>  <b>“Alternative education sites and marginalised young people: ‘I wish there were more schools like this one”,</b>  <i>International Journal of Inclusive Education, 16:8.</i>  <a href="https://www.tandfonline.com/wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/doi/full/10.1080/13603116.2010.529467?src=recsys">https://www.tandfonline.com/wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/doi/full/10.1080/13603116.2010.529467?src=recsys</a></p>	Australia	<p>Five alternative schooling sites in South East Queensland were involved in this study. The researchers visited each school for a week to observe, collect documents, and conduct interviews (with young people, workers, parents, and former students).</p>	<p>Factors that make the alternative schools in the study effective include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Recognition and support for difficult life circumstances:</b> this included providing daycare, social workers, and indigenous staff to help students find homes and negotiate with welfare agencies.</li> <li>• <b>School structures, curricula, and pedagogy that are attractive</b> to disengaged young people. The curricula helped students obtain part-time work via short courses (like barista training) while also allowing students to obtain their year 12 matriculation, university entry, vocational qualifications, and gain life skills.</li> <li>• Students across all sites said that their <b>relationship with workers and teachers</b> was the key factor to their engagement with the curriculum.</li> </ul>

Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
<p>McGregor, G. and Mills, M. (2012) "Alternative education sites and marginalised young people: 'I wish there were more schools like this one'" <i>International Journal of Inclusive Education</i> 16 (8): 843–862.  <a href="https://www-tandfonline-com.wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/doi/pdf/10.1080/13603116.2010.529467?needAccess=true">https://www-tandfonline-com.wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/doi/pdf/10.1080/13603116.2010.529467?needAccess=true</a></p>	Australia	<p>This paper reports on research conducted in alternative schools/flexible learning centres designed to support young people marginalised from mainstream schooling in Australia.</p> <p>The authors interviewed one parent, 26 teachers and workers, three former students and 41 current students from across the five alternative schooling sites.</p>	<p>The evidence derived from this study shows that for young people who are most at risk of dropping out, it is the <b>emotional labour</b> of the teachers and workers that often makes a difference. Moreover, the <b>pedagogy that flows from the closer relationships</b> engages and motivates students.</p>
<p>Newton, B. et al (2014) <i>The Youth Contract provision for 16- and 17 year-olds not in education, employment or training evaluation: Research report</i>, Department for Education.  <a href="https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/354706/RR318A_-_The_youth_contract_for_16-to_17-year-olds_not_in_education_employment_or_training_evaluation.pdf">https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/354706/RR318A - The youth contract for 16-to 17-year-olds not in education employment or training evaluation.pdf</a></p>	United Kingdom	<p>The Youth Contract offers additional support for disengaged 16-17 year olds to move into education, training or work with training. In most areas of England, the programme is run by specialist providers and paid for by the Education Funding Agency (EFA) implementing payment-by-results. This financing model allows providers only to claim a full payment (up to £2,200) if their participants successfully re-engaged in education or combinations of education and work in five out of six months after they first re-engage.</p> <p>11,144 Youth Contract participants were observed to have started the programme in the EFA-areas and 1,431 in three core cities between August 2012 and August 2013, with 17 year olds and male participants clearly over-represented.</p>	<p>Overall, the Youth Contract is found to <b>increase substantially re-engagement in learning of different levels in all areas</b>. In EFA-areas, 1,375 additional young people re-engaged in learning as a result of participating in the Youth Contract.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An early and substantial increase in the share of people starting training and development activities.</li> <li>• Subsequently, from initially low levels of engagement in education and employment with VET, more and more participants can be observed in these activities until twelve months after the start of the programme.</li> </ul>
<p>Phillips, R. (2013) "Toward authentic student-centered practices: Voices of alternative school students", <i>Education and Urban Society</i>, 45(6), 668-699.  <a href="http://journals.sagepub.com/wallaby.vu.edu.au:2048/doi/pdf/10.1177/0013124511424107">http://journals.sagepub.com/wallaby.vu.edu.au:2048/doi/pdf/10.1177/0013124511424107</a></p>	United States	<p>The conceptual framework of this study is grounded in social-cognitive theory and assumes that student perceptions and voice are valuable insights. It also assumes that when these insights are used to inform curriculum and instruction, there are improvements in engagement, motivation, student interest, and achievement.</p> <p>The study looks at prior positive and negative learning experiences to see how they can be used to create an authentic student-centred curriculum (SCC). 11 students.</p>	<p>Four themes emerged from interviews, observations, and journal entries: <b>Positive emotions and relationships result in successful learning</b>; negative emotions and relationships hinder learning. <b>Learning occurs more easily when it is connected to the real world</b>. <b>Student autonomy during learning is linked to achieving goals</b>. Giving disengaged students some authority over their learning can be empower, motivate, and increase chances of student success.</p>

Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
<p>Ross, A. et al (2011) <i>The impact of KS4 vocational courses on disengaged young people's engagement with education 15-18</i>, Centre for Analysis of Youth Transitions, Department for Education. <a href="https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/183241/DFE-RR165.pdf">https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/183241/DFE-RR165.pdf</a></p>	United Kingdom	<p>This study investigated the hypothesis that offering vocational options in Year 10 can help improve levels of educational engagement and subsequent outcomes among young people disengaged from education. Data for the research comes from the Longitudinal Study of Young People in England (LSYPE).</p>	<p>There was little evidence to support the hypothesis. Disengaged young people who reported following vocational courses did not differ from those who chose not to take these courses in terms of their subsequent engagement or destinations post Year 11.</p> <p>These initial findings suggest that disengaged young people who took at least one vocational course in Year 10 were more likely to show signs of disengagement over time compared to those who took no vocational courses. However, those who took vocational courses were also more likely to achieve basic qualifications at Key Stage 4, although they were less likely to achieve higher levels of qualifications. At age 17, they were less likely to be in full time education, part time education, or on a training course or apprenticeship, and more likely to be in full time work or doing something else.</p>
<p>San Martin, T. and Calabrese, R. (2011) "Empowering at-risk students through appreciative inquiry", <i>International Journal of Education Management</i>, 25:2, 110-123. <a href="https://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/abs/10.1108/095135411111107542">https://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/abs/10.1108/095135411111107542</a></p>	United States	<p>This study identified how at-risk high school students in an alternative school describe how they best learn, seeking to extrapolate their preferred learning practices to improve teacher pedagogical practices.</p> <p>The authors used a qualitative case study design to facilitate the first two stages of an appreciative inquiry (AI) 4-D cycle – discovery and dream. Eight alternative high school students, four males and four females, were purposively selected as participants. Data collection methods included: group discussions, semi-structured paired interviews, and participant generated documents and visual presentation for district administrators and teachers. Data were analysed using content analysis, open coding, axial coding, text analysis software, and pattern matching.</p>	<p>The study produced four salient findings: relevant experiences were important for learning; a cooperative and respectful learning environment is a core value; learning should be enjoyable; and, the concept of family became an important metaphor for the learning environment.</p>
<p>Schochet, P., McConnell, P. and Burghardt, J. (2003) <i>National job corps study: Findings using administrative earnings records data</i>, Mathematica Policy Research Inc. <a href="https://www.mathematica-mpr.com/our-publications-and-findings/publications/national-job-corps-study-findings-using-">https://www.mathematica-mpr.com/our-publications-and-findings/publications/national-job-corps-study-findings-using-</a></p>	United States	<p>This report presents findings from an analysis of administrative earnings records. It serves disadvantaged youths between the ages of 16 and 24, primarily in a residential setting. It provides comprehensive services—basic education, vocational skills training, health care and education, counselling, and residential support. Each year, Job Corps serves more than 60,000 new participants in about 120 centres nationwide, at a cost of about \$1.5 billion.</p> <p>These data allow us to address two questions:</p>	<p>The pattern of the estimated impacts using the survey and administrative data are similar in periods covered by both data sources. According to both the survey and administrative records data, the <b>estimated earnings impacts are negative in the first and second years after random assignment</b> (when the program group was enrolled in Job Corps) and positive and statistically significant in the third and fourth years after random assignment.</p>



Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
<a href="#">administrative-earnings-records-data</a>		<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Do survey and administrative earnings data yield similar impact estimates on earnings during the periods covered by both data sources?</li> <li>2. What are estimated impacts on earnings in the two and a half years beyond the four-year period covered by the survey?</li> </ol>	
<p>Skattebol, J. Saunders, P., Redmond, G., Bedford, M. and Cass, B. (2012)</p> <p><i>Making a difference: building on young people's experiences of economic adversity: Final Report</i>, Social Policy Research Centre</p> <p><a href="http://australianchildwellbeing.com.au/sites/default/files/uploads/Making%20A%20Difference.%20Building%20on%20Young%20People's%20Experiences%20of%20Economic%20Adversity.pdf">http://australianchildwellbeing.com.au/sites/default/files/uploads/Making%20A%20Difference.%20Building%20on%20Young%20People's%20Experiences%20of%20Economic%20Adversity.pdf</a></p>	Australia	One intensive case study at a site in the Sydney region. Semi-structured interviews with young people. A sample of 49 young people directly recruited through partner organisations, that is young people whose families were in direct receipt of services provided by these organisations that targeted low income families, and 47 young people recruited through universal services (in one instance a school and in the other a youth service in a disadvantaged area). All interviews and group work began with asking participants to complete a short questionnaire.	<p>Findings:</p> <p><b>Many participants did not have access to an adequate income to ensure they were able to participate</b> in education and social life at a level that most would consider normal for Australian young people.</p> <p>Young people (and their families) <b>develop their sense of self from their environments</b> and when they are housed and schooled in physically degraded environments, this affects their sense of self-efficacy.</p>
<p>Smyth, J. and McLnerney, P. (2013)</p> <p>"Making 'space': young people put at a disadvantage re-engaging with learning", <i>British Journal of Sociology and Education</i>, 34:1.</p> <p><a href="https://www.tandfonline.com/wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/doi/full/10.1080/01425692.2012.744735">https://www.tandfonline.com/wallaby.vu.edu.au:4433/doi/full/10.1080/01425692.2012.744735</a></p>	Australia (regional Victoria)	The primary source of data in the paper stems from interviews with 100 young people aged 13-19 who had left school but re-entered learning through six second chance to re-engagement programmes. They also interview 25 adults – teachers, managers, and other significant players in the lives of these students.	The main assumption of the paper is that students who leave school do not have a deficit, but rather it is the traditional school system that is getting it wrong. The authors argue that a "relational socio-spatial perspective" is necessary to examine the lives of young people who disengage from school, but who re-engage under conditions that differ from those that resulted in their exclusion from school to begin with.
<p>Spencer, M., Noll, E. and Cassidy, E. (2005)</p> <p>"Monetary incentives in support of academic achievement: Results of a randomized field trial involving high-achieving, low-resource, ethnically diverse urban adolescents", <i>Evaluation Review</i>, 29:3: 199–222.</p>	United States	This intervention involved paying students in the treatment group a monthly stipend, an amount that varied according to their grade level, for as long as they met set academic eligibility criteria. This was a large-scale trial involving 541 students randomly assigned to intervention (n = 330) and control groups (n = 211). All participants were high-achieving students from poor families with diverse ethnic backgrounds.	At the end of one year, <b>students in receipt of stipends showed a 10% higher retention rate than those in the 'delayed stipend' group</b> who did not receive monetary incentives. The suggestion is that such incentives were effective in helping high-achieving high school students from disadvantaged backgrounds to maintain their academic standing.



Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
<a href="http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0193841X04273329?journalCode=erxb">http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0193841X04273329?journalCode=erxb</a>			
<p><b>Stehlik, T. (2013)</b>  <b>“Addressing disengagement from schooling through community action networks”,</b>  <i>Journal of Educational Enquiry</i>, 12: 1, 15-24.  <a href="https://www.ojs.unisa.edu.au/index.php/EDEQ/article/view/803/628">https://www.ojs.unisa.edu.au/index.php/EDEQ/article/view/803/628</a></p>	Australia	<p>The projects raised the fact that disengagement from schooling and learning often began either in the transition from primary to high school around the age of 12 or 13; or even earlier during the primary school years. The Southern Innovative Community Action Networks (ICAN) Management Committee therefore commissioned research to investigate the value of applying the ICAN approach to the younger 10-12 age group. Reviews research conducted in Australia into the reasons why young people disengage from schooling, and outline some strategies and programs that have been successful. Included a literature review of early years intervention and research as well as existing policies and programs, then two rounds of data collection involving interviews with staff from schools, community agencies and case management providers.</p>	<p>The Innovative Community Action Networks (ICANs) is a South Australian Government program premised on the development of strong and valued local school and community partnerships which were created in the four regions of the state that were identified as having particularly low school retention.</p> <p>Important elements identified:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Attendance</b> - it is important to recognise that non-attendance is not usually due to the individual child’s reluctance to attend school, but to issues beyond their control such as lack of transport, family dysfunction etc.</li> <li>• <b>Community mentoring</b> - other significant adults are important, e.g. community volunteers, youth workers, case managers, social workers, school services officers and university student mentors.</li> <li>• <b>Early identification</b> of potential at-risk children and families through proactive engagement with the local community. School clusters could share a full-time dedicated social worker.</li> <li>• <b>Focus on a whole-of-school approach.</b> This may involve cultural change and professional development for educators around a holistic, child-centred approach; based on keeping all children within the school community and their peer groups.</li> <li>• <b>The middle schooling movement</b> supports students in the transition from primary to secondary schooling. Schools that adopt a middle school structure and philosophy to their teaching address the social and academic needs of the 8-12 years age group.</li> <li>• <b>Cluster arrangements</b> for schools working together appear to provide the best model for sharing resources, supporting students through transition, and fostering a whole-of-community approach to education.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Tanner, E. et al. (2009)</b>  <b>Activity Agreement Pilots Evaluation, National Centre for Social Research.</b>  <a href="http://natcen.ac.uk/our-research/research/activity-agreement-pilots-evaluation/">http://natcen.ac.uk/our-research/research/activity-agreement-pilots-evaluation/</a></p>	United Kingdom	<p>This was a quantitative impact evaluation comparing two samples of young people not in education, employment or training (NEETs), those in Activity Agreement pilot areas and those not. It fed into a wider evaluation of the pilot for the Department for Children, Schools and Families carried out by NatCen, the Institute for Employment Studies and the Centre for Employment and Industry.</p> <p>It tested the effectiveness of a Government initiative – the Activity Agreements Pilot - to</p>	<p>Found it had had a <b>small but positive impact on taking part in positive activities</b> 12 months after becoming NEET: 26% of participants reported participating in personal development activities who without an Activity Agreement (AA) would not have done. About 3% of participants entered work-based training as a direct impact of AA. 7% of participants took up a qualification as a result of AA. However, take up of paid work without training was 10% lower than it would have been without AA.</p>

Study	Country	Setting/participants	Findings
		<p>encourage disengaged young people back into education, employment and training. NEETs were given financial incentives to take part in activities that were tailored to their needs and interests. These activities could be job related, focused on personal development or college based.</p>	
<p><b>Thomas, J., McGinty, S., te Riele, K. and Wilson, K. (2017)</b>  <b>“Distance travelled: outcomes and evidence in flexible learning options”</b>  <i>Australian Educational Researcher</i>, 44: 4-5, 443-460.  <a href="https://youthplusinstitute.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Distance-Travelled.pdf">https://youthplusinstitute.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Distance-Travelled.pdf</a></p>	Australia	<p>In-depth interviews with 92 practitioners (i.e. teachers, youth/social workers, support staff and programme administrators) across eight sites. To address early school leaving, state and non-governmental organisations in Australia have developed programs broadly identified as flexible learning options (FLOs) to provide alternative educational pathways for disengaged junior and senior secondary students. This study examines the education outcomes of these FLOs.</p>	<p>The following were found to be important elements in successful FLO:  <b>Engagement:</b> practitioners interviewed for the study consistently voiced engagement as a fundamental outcome of FLOs. Engagement is quantitatively measured by attendance – students consistently show up, whereas in traditional settings they often did not. <b>Wellbeing:</b> in FLOs, wellbeing encompasses physical, mental, and emotional health. <b>Literacy and numeracy:</b> practitioners noted the importance of functional literacy and numeracy. <b>Certificates and credentials:</b> by helping the whole person, practitioners in FLOs can help students obtain credentials that will break cycles of poverty and help them become functional members of society. <b>Post-programme transitional pathways:</b> practitioners were committed to providing successful pathways including certification, employability, and transition to further education, training and employment. Practitioners interviewed were adamant that their professional outcomes not simply be tied to these quantifiable criteria but rather to engagement and enhanced wellbeing of the young people they work with. Objective indicators were not used in this study to underscore the accomplishments of young people in the programs. Outcomes in nearly all cases were appraised by the personal progress made relative to the individual’s unique starting point.</p>
<p><b>Wong, V. (2012)</b>  <b>"Social withdrawal as invisible youth disengagement: Government inaction and NGO responses in Hong Kong"</b>  <i>International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy</i>, 32:7-8, 415-430.  <a href="https://doi.org/10.1108/01443331211249057">https://doi.org/10.1108/01443331211249057</a></p>	Hong Kong	<p>Four focus group interviews with the project team of ten social workers.</p>	<p>Substantiated with empirical findings, the paper argues that young people in social withdrawal characterized by their socially avoidant behaviour and deprivation of an engagement status as a worker, student or trainee are largely invisible to the state because of the latter’s insensitivity to the heterogeneity and diversity of disengaged youth and reproduction of the anti-social notion of at-risk youth. A flexible and tailor-made strategy initiated by an NGO is argued to be more effective in meeting the needs of silently-disengaged young people.</p>

## Selected grey and policy literature

Title	Country	Objective	Findings
<p>Borrell, J. et al (2011) <i>Re-engaging disengaged youth: A research and program design project</i>, Kildonan Uniting care.</p> <p><a href="https://www.kildonan.org.au/media-and-publications/research/re-engaging-disengaged-youth/">https://www.kildonan.org.au/media-and-publications/research/re-engaging-disengaged-youth/</a></p>	Australia	<p>Kildonan was commissioned to carry out a research project to develop a program of integrated activities targeting young people on the Pavilion School waiting list that could also be delivered as a preparatory program for young people returning to education or training after a period of disengagement. Interviews and focus groups were carried out, with variations to questions depending on the role of the interviewee in the program.</p>	<p>Characteristics of successful alternative learning programs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Personal care and affirmation:</b> an individualized nurturing approach from teachers for students to ensure students feel cared for. Other elements of a nurturing approach include:</li> <li>• <b>Parental involvement:</b> While many disengaged students have parents who are unable to care for them, it is important that those who can are invited to participate in their child's education.</li> <li>• <b>Learning and training:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Should be individualized and one-on-one</li> <li>○ Adult learning approach, where students feel respected</li> <li>○ Relevant and motivating skills-based learning</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Social Connection:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Contacts with role models for continuing education and training</li> <li>○ Exposure to vocational ideas and possibilities</li> <li>○ Linking young people to other organizations</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Course Design:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Voluntary attendance and short days</li> <li>○ Attractive, fun, engaging activities</li> <li>○ Recognition of success through awards, certificates, etc.</li> <li>○ Establishing a routine as a stepping stone to further education or training</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<p>Burns, J. et al. (2008) <i>Preventing Youth Disengagement and Promoting Engagement</i>, Australian Research Alliance for Children &amp; Youth</p> <p><a href="https://www.aracy.org.au/publications-resources/command/download_file/id/120/filename/Preventing_Youth_Disengagement_and_Promoting_Engagement.pdf">https://www.aracy.org.au/publications-resources/command/download_file/id/120/filename/Preventing_Youth_Disengagement_and_Promoting_Engagement.pdf</a></p>	Australia	<p>This project identifies key principles for good practice that support successful transitions for disadvantaged young people (aged 15-24 years) into secure and meaningful employment or 'decent work'. It focuses on supports for young people who are unemployed or not in employment, education or training (NEET). The project involved three complementary methodologies:</p> <p>A review of national and international data on youth unemployment.</p> <p>A review of Australian and international research, meta-analyses and external evaluations</p> <p>A local study on young people's experiences of youth unemployment and NEET status based on analysis of local area employment statistics.</p>	<p>The question 'what works?' to prevent disengagement should be an easy one to answer and yet there is no common literature that focuses on interventions for 'disengagement'. Academics have failed to reach consensus on what disengagement is and approaches across disciplines vary. In trying to make sense of this complex literature one common theme emerged – young people who feel valued, who are provided with opportunities to participate and have the skills and capacity to participate and who feel connected to family, friends and their community are less likely to experience disengagement. It therefore becomes irrelevant to argue for one approach above another but rather it makes sense to draw on the strengths of a number of different but complementary approaches.</p>
<p>Dommers, M., Myconos, G., Swain, L. Yung, S. and Clarke, K.</p>	Australia	<p>Through interviews and focus groups with young people and those from organisations and agencies</p>	<p>The most recent data on completion rates for young VET students (25 years and under) without prior post-school program completion shows a completion rate</p>

Title	Country	Objective	Findings
<p><b>(2017) <i>Engaging young early school leavers in vocational training</i>, National Centre for Vocational Education Research (NCVER).</b>  <a href="https://www.ncver.edu.au/_data/assets/pdf_file/0020/1390700/Engaging-young-early-school-leavers-in-vocational-training.pdf">https://www.ncver.edu.au/_data/assets/pdf_file/0020/1390700/Engaging-young-early-school-leavers-in-vocational-training.pdf</a></p>		<p>serving the interests of young people, as well as with training provider staff, this study sought to determine what actions and initiatives would maximise the successful entry into and engagement with VET for young early school leavers. The focus of the study was on selected economically disadvantaged areas in Queensland, Victoria and Tasmania.</p>	<p>in 2015 of 58.3% (NCVER (2017) Australian vocational education and training statistics: VET program completion rates 2011—2015, NCVER, Adelaide.  <b>At the pre-enrolment stage</b>, information is vital. Training providers and support services need to work together to demystify the VET sector for young early school leavers to enable them to gain a greater awareness of what VET is.  <b>At enrolment</b>, the complexity of the process, as well as of VET funding and subsidy structures, can be overwhelming for young early school leavers. Engaging young people in the process through the provision of well-communicated information is needed at this stage.  <b>During training</b>, the provision of multiple supports — logistic, academic or social — from both training providers and support services working together is needed.</p> <p>Offers a number of recommendations (mostly for VET providers) to better meet the needs of early school leavers – for example offering services that flexibly meet the needs of this group, greater emphasis on lower level foundational courses, improved wellbeing and learner supports, flexible pathways, creative local solutions to improve transport options for students, better information to school students about VET.</p>
<p><b>Goss, P. and Sonnemann, J. (2017) <i>Engaging students: Creating classrooms that improve learning</i> Grattan Institute.</b>  <a href="https://grattan.edu.au/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/Engaging-students-creating-classrooms-that-improve-learning.pdf">https://grattan.edu.au/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/Engaging-students-creating-classrooms-that-improve-learning.pdf</a></p>	Australia	<p>A policy report focusing on classroom strategies to prevent disengagement or re-engage disengaged students. Provides a number of recommendations – at both the school and system level. More about the passively disengaged than the highly disengaged and vulnerable.</p>	<p>Provides a number of evidence based strategies for teachers to address passive disengagement or disruptive behavior in the classroom. Also provides recommendations for schools and systems, mostly about supporting and empowering teachers and creating better collaboration. Also recommends better initial teacher training and better access to the evidence base of what works.</p> <p>Australian students are about average in their engagement with school. Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) measures students’ engagement with school by asking students about their ‘sense of belonging’ at school and looking at rates of absenteeism. Australian students had a slightly lower than average sense of belonging to school, while rates of absenteeism were more than twice the international average. Twenty-two per cent of Australian students do not feel they belong at school and 32 per cent of students had recently skipped a day of school.</p>
<p><b>Lamb, S. and Rice, S. (2008) <i>Effective strategies to increase school completion report</i>, University of Melbourne</b>  <a href="http://csmp.manukau.ac.nz/_data/assets/pdf_file/0009/89982/effectivestrategiesreportprint.pdf">http://csmp.manukau.ac.nz/_data/assets/pdf_file/0009/89982/effectivestrategiesreportprint.pdf</a></p>	Australia	<p>The targeted initiatives include student focused strategies such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• mentoring,</li> <li>• early and more intensive pathways and careers planning,</li> <li>• careers guidance managed by appropriately qualified staff,</li> <li>• fine-grained co-ordination of welfare needs,</li> <li>• family outreach,</li> <li>• programs to improve students’ social skills,</li> <li>• tutoring and peer tutoring,</li> <li>• targeted financial</li> </ul>	<p>The most effective programs appear to do the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• foster connectedness between students, parents, the school and the community,</li> <li>• increase the trust placed in students</li> <li>• provide tasks for students with immediate, tangible benefits</li> <li>• make spaces within schools and curricula for diverse student need</li> <li>• address poor achievement</li> <li>• address students’ practical personal obstacles to staying at school.</li> </ul>

Title	Country	Objective	Findings
		<p>support, • case management, and • targeted assistance for skill development among low achievers.</p> <p>They also include school-wide strategies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• familial-based forms of organisation such as mini-schools,</li> <li>• team-based approaches to teaching, learning and pastoral care,</li> <li>• early intervention to support literacy and numeracy skill growth,</li> <li>• project-based and applied approaches to learning,</li> <li>• pathways planning and quality careers guidance and counselling, such as outlined in the MIPS Good Practice Framework,</li> <li>• smaller class sizes,</li> <li>• strategic use of teachers and teaching resources,</li> <li>• initiatives to improve connections with parents,</li> <li>• priority professional development,</li> <li>• broad curriculum provision with strong VET options, and</li> <li>• high expectations on attendance and behaviour</li> </ul>	<p>In addition, the schools most successful at increasing school completion adopted the following principles, which are also supported by the international literature:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Early intervention</b> - schools that had increased student engagement and retention identified student problems such as weak achievement or welfare needs at an early stage, and were proactive in addressing them.</li> <li>• Ensure <b>interventions are sustained</b> - schools that provided program continuity and long-term supports for students were most successful in addressing achievement and engagement issues.</li> <li>• Adopt <b>multifaceted approaches</b> -it is usually the case that no single strategy works alone to increase student engagement and retention. Rather, successful schools used a range of strategies to address a variety of student needs.</li> <li>• <b>Context sensitivity is essential</b> - numerous research participants noted the importance of selecting and adjusting strategies according to the needs of the local students and parents.</li> <li>• <b>Supportive school culture</b> greatly improves effectiveness - the schools most successful in engaging and retaining students had an integrated approach, underpinned by a well-articulated philosophy that drove all aspects of provision and a culture of continuous improvement.</li> </ul>
<p>Mitchell, J. (2016) <i>Out of sight, out of mind?: The exclusion of students from Victorian schools, a preliminary discussion paper</i>, Youth Affairs Council of Victoria  <a href="https://www.yacvic.org.au/assets/Documents/SUB-School-exclusions-in-Victoria-2016.pdf">https://www.yacvic.org.au/assets/Documents/SUB-School-exclusions-in-Victoria-2016.pdf</a></p>	Australia	<p>A policy document outlining the available data on suspensions and expulsions in Victoria and the policy responses to them. Of limited use as its only looking at expulsion and suspension and not disengagement more broadly, and also is only Victoria. Useful because it sets out a number of studies showing suspensions and expulsions don't result in good outcomes.</p>	<p>Cites evidence of a number of recent studies – notably a 2009 survey of 4,000 Australian and American students – assert that suspension increases a young person's likelihood of engaging in risk-taking activities. Being suspended often means a student spends more time away from adult supervision, bored and disengaged from positive school influences.</p> <p>One 2010 study conducted through the Centre for Adolescent Health, Murdoch Children's Institute, found that school suspension was the third biggest risk factor increasing a student's likelihood of engaging in anti-social behaviour and violence. (S.A. Hemphill and J. Hargreaves, 'School suspensions - a resource for teachers and school administrators', Centre for Adolescent Health, Murdoch Childrens Research Institute, Melbourne 2010).</p>
<p><b>Ofsted (2010)</b>  <i>Reducing the numbers of young people not in education, employment or training: what works and why</i>, Office for Standards in Education, Children's Services and Skills, (Ofsted)</p>	United Kingdom	<p>In 2009, Ofsted (United Kingdom Office for Standards in Education) inspectors visited 12 areas experiencing reductions in the proportion of young people 16-18 not in education, employment or training to identify the factors that contributed to the improvements so that others could learn from the good practice. During the survey, inspectors spoke to over 700 young people, individually and in groups, and made visits to 28 schools, 18</p>	<p>In the most successful areas, local authorities worked closely with a wide range of partners, including those in the voluntary and community sectors, to develop a shared vision for reducing disengagement by young people.</p> <p>A coordinated approach to gathering and sharing information ensured that support focused on specific schools, wards or groups of young people likely to be at risk. <b>Local political commitment, strong leadership, and a readiness to align and pool resources and funding ensured that individual programmes which had proved successful were sustained and integrated into the overall strategy.</b> The close involvement of young people in developing, reviewing and</p>

Title	Country	Objective	Findings
<a href="http://dera.ioe.ac.uk/1106/1/Reducing%20the%20numbers%20of%20young%20people%20NEET.pdf">http://dera.ioe.ac.uk/1106/1/Reducing%20the%20numbers%20of%20young%20people%20NEET.pdf</a>		colleges and 84 voluntary sector, training and other providers.	revising programmes ensured that provision was carefully matched to their needs. Findings <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The most effective partnerships recognised the factors, such as poor school attendance and a family history of unemployment, that were most often associated with disengagement from education, training and employment.</li> <li>• The most successful providers <b>recognised that young people who had dropped out of education and training often needed help to resolve personal and social problems before they could return.</b></li> <li>• The nature and location of training were also important. Young people whose experiences of school had been negative often responded well to <b>short, flexible, accredited programmes that were mostly vocational in nature and carefully matched to their needs and circumstances.</b></li> <li>• Structured approaches to <b>work experience</b> through volunteering, combined with mentoring and financial support, were particularly effective.</li> <li>• Essential to success was the <b>quality of the relationships</b> between the young people and an adviser, teacher or key worker who provided continuity of support and guidance to help them find a new direction and purpose to their lives.</li> </ul>
<b>Polidano, C. and Tseng, P. (2012)</b> <i>A Second Chance at Education for Early School Leavers,</i> University of Melbourne <a href="https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/09645292.2013.834294?needAccess=true">https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/09645292.2013.834294?needAccess=true</a>		The objective is to better understand the factors that affect the chances of re-engaging early school leavers in education, with a particular focus on the importance of time out from school (duration dependence) and school-related factors. Using data from three cohorts of the Longitudinal Survey of Australian Youth and duration models that control for unobserved heterogeneity, our results suggest that programmes that encourage an early return to study and those that develop post-school career plans may be more effective than programmes that concentrate on improving numeracy and literacy scores.	Results suggest that programmes that encourage an early return to study and those that develop post-school career plans may be more effective than programmes that concentrate on improving numeracy and literacy scores.
<b>Skattebol, J., Hill, T. and Griffiths, A. (2015)</b> <i>Unpacking Youth Unemployment Final Report,</i> Social Policy Research Centre, University of New South Wales.	Australia	The review explored evidence for good practice in programs promoting transitions for disadvantaged young people. While this review is organised into education and employment focussed programs it is important to note there are a small number of innovative hybrid programs which offer supports	The question of ‘What works?’ has been consistently identified by researchers as a very difficult question to answer. The factors that contribute to youth employment are multidimensional, enduring and compounding. There is a lack of reliable evidence from evaluations and most programs only address one dimension and often only in a limited way.

Title	Country	Objective	Findings
<a href="https://www.sprc.unsw.edu.au/media/SPRCFile/Unpacking_Youth_Unemployment_Final_report.pdf">https://www.sprc.unsw.edu.au/media/SPRCFile/Unpacking_Youth_Unemployment_Final_report.pdf</a>		to young people through education into secure work.	
<p>Stokes, H. and Turnbull, M. (2016) <i>Evaluation of the Berry Street Education Model: Trauma informed positive education enacted in mainstream schools: Research Report</i>, Youth Research Centre, University of Melbourne, <a href="https://trove.nla.gov.au/work/213268214?q&amp;versionId=234177226">https://trove.nla.gov.au/work/213268214?q&amp;versionId=234177226</a></p>	Australia	<p>The Berry Street Education Model (BSEM) Trauma-Informed Positive Education (TIPE) initiative aims to expand the possibilities of teaching and learning through integrating clinical, educational and welfare approaches and perspectives.</p> <p>In 2015, Berry Street partnered with two Government schools, one Primary and one P-12, by piloting the Model in selected mainstream classes.</p> <p>Interview data was drawn from focus groups conducted with students, teachers and school leadership during two sets of visits to the participant schools (Latimer Valley P-12 and Mt Excel PS).</p>	<p>Interviewees at both settings noted that implementation of the BSEM has been consistent with changes over recent years to school culture and growing recognition of the need for alternative pedagogical approaches that aim to address the needs of a growing sector of the student population.</p> <p>Quantitative findings, while not always consistent, have – in general terms – supported qualitative evidence as to the:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Positive impacts of the BSEM on students’ literacy and numeracy attainment</b> (as demonstrated by the effect size data in</li> <li>• <b>Significant decreases in suspension data</b> for both schools among students involved in the BSEM program; and</li> <li>• <b>Overall improvements to wellbeing data.</b></li> </ul> <p>Differences in the degree of positive impact appear to be related primarily to the mode of delivery at each setting. It seems logical to deduce that optimum positive outcomes are achieved when (as at Mt Excel PS):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Aspects of the Model are <b>incorporated into everyday classroom routine</b> (rather than be limited to specific spots on the timetable)</li> <li>• The Model has been <b>adopted across the whole school</b> (rather than be confined to one area of the school)</li> <li>• All <b>staff have been formally (and rigorously) trained</b> by Berry Street personnel.</li> </ul>



# Appendix B: List of references

- Alzua, M. Cruces, G. and Lopez-Erao, C. (2013) "Youth training programs beyond employment. Evidence from a randomised controlled trial".
- Attanasio, O. Kugler, A. and Meghir, C. (2011) "Subsidizing vocational training for disadvantaged youth in Colombia: Evidence from a randomised trial", *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 3, 188-220.
- Beng H., Gorard, S. and Torgerson, C. (2012) "Promoting Post-16 Participation of Ethnic Minority Students from Disadvantaged Backgrounds: A Systematic Review of the Most Promising Interventions", *Research in Post-Compulsory Education* 17:4, 409-22.
- Borland, J. and Tseng, Y. (2007) "Does a minimum job search requirement reduce time on unemployment payments? Evidence from the Jobseeker Diary in Australia" *Industrial and Labour Relations Review*, 60:3, 357-378.
- Borland, J., Tseng, Y. and Wilkins, R. (2013) "Does coordination of welfare services delivery make a difference for extremely disadvantaged jobseekers? Evidence from the 'YP4' Trial", *Economic Record*, 89:287, 469-489.
- Borrell, J. et al (2011) *Re-engaging disengaged youth: A research and program design project*, Kildonan Uniting care.
- Burns, J. et al. (2008) *Preventing Youth Disengagement and Promoting Engagement*, Australian Research Alliance for Children & Youth.
- Cave, G., Bos, H., Doolittle, F. and Toussaint, C. (1993) "JOBSTART: Final report on a program for school dropouts", Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation.
- Chen, X. (2013) "Partial identification of average treatment effects in program evaluation: Theory and applications", Open Access Dissertations, 1050.
- Courtney, M., Zinn, A., Zielewski, E., Bess, R., Malm, K., Stagner, M. & Pergamit, M. (2008) "Evaluation of the early start to emancipation preparation – tutoring program Los Angeles County, California: Final report", Chicago, The Urban Institute, Chaplin Hall Center for Children and National Opinion Research Center.
- Creed, P. (1999) "Predisposing factors and consequences of occupational status for long-term unemployed youth: a longitudinal examination", *Journal of Adolescence*, 22:1, 81-93.
- Davies, M., Lamb, S., and Doecke, E. (2011) "Strategic review of effective re-engagement models for disengaged learners", *Melbourne: Centre for Research on Education Systems-University of Melbourne*.
- Devaney, C. (2009) "Realistic expectations: accounting for young people's progress in training programmes", *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 22: 1, 8-20.
- Dommers, M., Myconos, G., Swain, L. Yung, S. and Clarke, K. (2017) *Engaging young early school leavers in vocational training*, National Centre for Vocational Education Research (NCVER).
- Durlak, J., Weissberg, R. and Pachan, M. (2010) "A meta-analysis of after-school programs that seek to promote personal and social skills in children and adolescents", *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 45:(3-4), 294-309.
- Evans, R., Brown, R. Rees, G. and Smith, P. (2017) "Systematic review of educational interventions for looked-after children and young people: Recommendations for intervention development and evaluation", *British Educational Research Journal*, 43:1, 68-94.
- Goss, P. and Sonnemann, J. (2017) *Engaging students: Creating classrooms that improve learning*, Grattan Institute.



Grace, M. and Gill, R. (2014) "Improving outcomes for unemployed and homeless young people: Findings of the YP4 clinical controlled trial of joined up case management", *Australian Social Work*, 67:3 419-437.

Green, J. et al (2014) "Multidimensional treatment foster care for adolescents in English care: Randomised trial and observational cohort evaluation", *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 204, 214–221.

Gutherson, P., Davies, H. and Daszkiewicz, T. (2011) "Achieving successful outcomes through Alternative Education Provision: an international literature review", *CfBT Education Trust*.

Jeynes, W. (2012) "A meta-analysis of the efficacy of different types of parental involvement programs for urban students", *Urban Education*, 47, 706–742.

Keddie, A. (2014) "Indigenous representation and alternative schooling: Prioritising an epistemology of relationality." *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 18:1, 55-71.

Kendall, S., Straw, S., Jones, M., Springate, I. and Grayson, H. (2008) "A Review of the research evidence (narrowing the gap in outcomes for vulnerable groups)", *National Foundation for Educational Research*.

Kettlewell, K., Southcott, C., Stevens, E. and McCrone, T. (2012) "Engaging the disengaged", National Foundation for Education Research (NFER) Research Program: From Education to Employment.

Lamb, S. and Rice, S. (2008) *Effective strategies to increase school completion report*, University of Melbourne.

Leve, L., and Chamberlain, P. (2007) "A randomised evaluation of multidimensional treatment foster care: Effects on school attendance and homework completion in juvenile justice girls", *Research on Social Work Practice*, 17, 657–663.

Mawn, L. et al. (2017) "Are we failing young people not in employment, education or training (NEETs)? A systematic review and meta-analysis of re-engagement interventions", *Systematic Reviews* 6:16.

Maynard, B. et al. (2012) "Indicated Truancy Interventions: Effects on School Attendance among Chronic Truant Students", *Campbell Systematic Reviews*, 2012:10.

McGinty, S., Stemp, K. and Wilson, K. (2011) "Re-engaging young people with education and training: What are the alternatives", *Youth Studies Australia*, 30:4, 32-39.

McGregor, G. and Mills, M. (2012) "Alternative education sites and marginalised young people: 'I wish there were more schools like this one'", *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 16:8.

McGregor, G. and Mills, M. (2012) "Alternative education sites and marginalised young people: 'I wish there were more schools like this one'", *International Journal of Inclusive Education* 16 (8): 843–862.

Mitchell, J. (2016) *Out of sight, out of mind?: The exclusion of students from Victorian schools, a preliminary discussion paper*, Youth Affairs Council of Victoria.

Newton, B. et al (2014) *The Youth Contract provision for 16- and 17 year-olds not in education, employment or training evaluation: Research report*, Department for Education.

Ofsted (2010) *Reducing the numbers of young people not in education, employment or training: what works and why*, Office for Standards in Education, Children's Services and Skills, (Ofsted).

O'Gorman, E., Salmon, N. and Murphy, C. (2016) "Schools as sanctuaries: A systematic review of contextual factors which contribute to student retention in alternative education", *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 20:5, 536-551.

Phillips, R. (2013) "Toward authentic student-centered practices: Voices of alternative school students", *Education and Urban Society*, 45(6), 668-699.

Polidano, C. and Tseng, P. (2012) *A Second Chance at Education for Early School Leavers*, University of Melbourne.

Rodríguez-Planas, N. (2012) "Mentoring, educational services, and incentives to learn: What do we know about them?", *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 35:4, 481-490.

Ross, A. et al (2011) *The impact of KS4 vocational courses on disengaged young people's engagement with education 15-18*, Centre for Analysis of Youth Transitions, Department for Education.

- San Martin, T. and Calabrese, R. (2011) "Empowering at-risk students through appreciative inquiry", *International Journal of Education Management*, 25:2, 110-123.
- Schochet, P., McConnell, P. and Burghardt, J. (2003) *National job corps study: Findings using administrative earnings records data*, Mathematica Policy Research Inc.
- Skattebol, J., Hill, T. and Griffiths, A. (2015) *Unpacking Youth Unemployment Final Report*, Social Policy Research Centre, University of New South Wales.
- Skattebol, J. Saunders, P., Redmond, G., Bedford, M. and Cass, B. (2012) *Making a difference: building on young people's experiences of economic adversity: Final Report*, Social Policy Research Centre.
- Smyth, J. and McNerney, P. (2013) "Making 'space': young people put at a disadvantage re-engaging with learning", *British Journal of Sociology and Education*, 34:1.
- Spencer, M., Noll, E. and Cassidy, E. (2005) "Monetary incentives in support of academic achievement: Results of a randomized field trial involving high-achieving, low-resource, ethnically diverse urban adolescents", *Evaluation Review*, 29:3: 199–222.
- Stehlik, T. (2013) "Addressing disengagement from schooling through community action networks", *Journal of Educational Enquiry*, 12: 1, 15-24.
- Stokes, H. and Turnbull, M. (2016) *Evaluation of the Berry Street Education Model: Trauma informed positive education enacted in mainstream schools: Research Report*, Youth Research Centre, University of Melbourne.
- Tanner, E. et al. (2009) *Activity Agreement Pilots Evaluation*, National Centre for Social Research.
- Tanner-Smith, E. and Wilson, S. (2013) "A meta-analysis of the Effects of dropout prevention programs on school absenteeism", *Prevention Science* 14:5, 468-478.
- Thomas, J., McGinty, S., te Riele, K. and Wilson, K. (2017) "Distance travelled: outcomes and evidence in flexible learning options", *Australian Educational Researcher*, 44: 4-5, 443-460.
- Valentine, J. et al. (2009) "Systematic reviews of research: Postsecondary transitions - identifying effective models and practices", *National Centre for Career and Technical Education*.
- Wheeler, M., Keller, T. and DuBois, D. (2010) "Review of three recent randomized trials of school-based mentoring: Making sense of mixed findings", *Social Policy Report*, 24: 3.
- Wilson, S. et al. (2013) "Dropout prevention and intervention programs for improving school completion among school-aged children and youth: A systematic review", *Journal of the Society for Social Work and Research*, 4:4.
- Wong, V. (2012) "Social withdrawal as invisible youth disengagement: Government inaction and NGO responses in Hong Kong", *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 32:7-8, 415-430.
- Zaff, J. et al. (2017) "Factors that promote high school graduation: a review of the literature", *Education Psychology Review*, 29, 447-476.



Mitchell Institute  
300 Queen Street, Melbourne, Victoria 3000  
+61 3 9919 1820  
[info@mitchellinstitute.org.au](mailto:info@mitchellinstitute.org.au)  
[mitchellinstitute.org.au](http://mitchellinstitute.org.au)

